

**CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSIONS AND ISSUES FOR FURTHER  
RESEARCH**

## 6.1 OVERVIEW

This research set out to answer the question: why, despite the significant political and financial support of successive Egyptian governments to the urban development of Tenth of Ramadan City and its industrial areas, did the physical planning practice fail to achieve the pre-stated goals and objectives of the successive urban development policies and local physical plans in the period of 1974 till 2002? The research shows that there are no simple answers to the above question: there does not seem to be an unequivocal explanation for such failure. The research, nonetheless, postulates that the reason behind such failure resulted from the continuous shift in the allocation of power and resources within the 'triangle of power' (i.e. the institutions, agencies and individuals of the central government, local authorities, and private sector), as the national political economy, institutional arrangements and power structures at the national and local levels continuously changed during the study period. The above hypothesis proved to be workable and effective, as it theoretically and empirically guided the research to cast light on the complexity of the administrative, technical, political and social processes underpinning physical planning practice and the urban development process.

The research succeeded in achieving the pre-stated objectives introduced in chapter 1. It has reviewed the different theoretical stands, positions, claims, arguments and debates within the field of urban development planning theory and practice from within a historical perspective while debating the underpinning conceptual thoughts of each approach with specific reference to social structures. Given the focus of this research, it has to be stressed that the analysis of the different approaches to social structures is not based upon the broad perspective of social theory but rather upon the specific understanding of a conceptual dichotomy in social theory, that of the notion of structure and agency, which proved to have strong and valuable implications for the analysis of urban development planning theory and practice.

As well as exploring and analysing the theoretical connections between the above areas of knowledge, this study also has succeeded in casting light on the gap in the literature with respect to the reasons behind the emergence of new interests, values and institutions in society in specific time and space edge. It has built a workable analytical framework to explore and analyse urban development planning policies and practice in the context of the case study. Although the analytical framework was built to

explain and analyse the urban development planning and physical planning practice in the context of Egypt in general and TRC in specific, the conceptual arguments upon which it was built are relevant for many other countries.

Empirically, the research presents a history of Egypt's national development challenges (i.e. human settlements and economic challenges) and the national development policies adopted to face such challenges by successive political regimes since 1974 till 2002. It also empirically succeeded in exploring and analysing links and interactions between changes in the global political economy environment, international and national powerful interest groups, the political leadership, and the existing socio-political and socio-economic structures and their impact on the objectives and goals of national urban development planning policies. While analysing the interaction of power and interests between the above structures, agencies and individuals, the research provided an insight into the reasons for differences and conflicts between the objectives of national development policies and subsequent urban development policies adopted to help confront a range of national development challenges and their outcomes.

Using the case study methodology, the research illustrated the empirical links between successive urban development planning policies adopted to face human settlements and economic challenges and the physical planning practice in the context of Tenth of Ramadan City (TRC). It shed light into, while demonstrating the reasons for, the decision-making cycle, the effectiveness of administrative structures, and the inherited constraints associated with both the urban development planning formulation and implementation processes. This research provides a degree of clarity and understanding of the politics of physical planning practice as well as the constraints in urban development planning formulation and implementations processes.

## **6.2 THE THEORETICAL SCOPE AND ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK**

This research is interested in the relationship between physical planning practice, institutional arrangements and power structures, and political economy change. In order to explore and analyse the above relationship, an understanding of the wider theoretical context of the different approaches to social structures with specific reference to the notion of structure and agency lies at the core of this research. The understanding of such approaches provides the theoretical base upon which the state institutions, agencies and individuals relate to the different interest groups, agencies and individuals in society. It also provides the theoretical base for exploring and explaining

the reasons and causes behind the emergence, as well as the disappearance, of specific interests and values in society in specific time-space edge. From the literature review and theoretical analysis introduced in chapter 2, it can be said that an understanding of the theoretical bases upon which such social relationships are built, explained by the different approaches to social structures, lies at the heart of urban planning theory.

Following the above, this thesis critically illustrates and examines the theoretical debates with respect to the constraining and enabling factors of social structures and agencies as well as their interaction. It also provides a critical understanding of the planning paradigm. Given Kuhn's (1963) definition of a 'paradigm' and Safier's (1990) and Moser's (1993) definition of physical planning practice, presented in chapter 2, the planning paradigm can be said to have three dimensions: traditions (professional specialisation), a body of theory, and methodologies. First, this research adopts Safier's (1990) classification of planning traditions, which comprises three main groups: the physical (classic) traditions, the applied traditions, and the transformative traditions. As illustrated in chapter 2, the research also chronologically traces the planning traditions by exploring their origins, disciplines within which they were developed, foci, objectives, methodologies, globally supporting institutions, views about society (i.e. perception about social structures), and models of economic process upon which they built their profession.

Second, while providing a critical understanding and analysis of the various urban development planning theories and approaches to land development, this research emphasises the challenge of the stereotype assumptions about households and planning intervention as well as stressing the global shift from modernist to post-modernist thinking in the field of urban planning practice. Third, the research also critically examines and analyses the development of the planning methodologies adopted by practitioners, analysts, researchers and policy makers across time since the emergence of the planning paradigm and the recognition of urban planning as a profession.

Supported by the examination and analysis of the above areas of knowledge and bodies of theories, the research introduces an analytical framework through which the physical planning practice in the context of Egypt in general and TRC in specific could be explored, analysed and explained. Supported by the theoretical debates, analysis and criticism presented in chapter 2, the analytical framework stresses five critical entry points for the analysis of physical planning practice, with respect to the formulation and

implementation processes. In doing so, the analytical framework emphasises the significant impact of the interaction of power and interests among the political leadership and powerful individuals, existing socio-economic and socio-political structures, and international and national interest agencies and institutions on physical planning practice at both the national and local levels. It proved to be an effective and workable tool through which the impact of the continuous shift in the allocation of power and resources within the 'triangle of power' on the physical planning practice and urban development process within the context of the case study could be systematically documented, examined, analysed, and explained.

Given the above emphasis, the research succeeded in critically exploring and examining the links between urban development planning and physical planning practice and the wider political economy environment and its underlying links to institutional arrangements and power structures. It also explained the reasons and causes behind the emergence and disappearance of specific interests and values within society in specific time-space edge. The analysis of physical planning practice in the context of the case study from the institutional arrangements, power structure, and interests and values of actors involved in such practice, proved to be effective entry points upon which the analytical framework was built.

### **6.3 THE METHODOLOGY OF THE RESEARCH**

The methodology of the research went through several refining stages since its original design. Each stage was based upon the findings of several pilot trips conducted prior to the actual fieldwork trip. Although the methodology was based upon a combination of the two main approaches to research methodology (i.e. qualitative and quantitative approaches), it adopted a dominant-less-dominant style in dealing with such combination. Given the explanatory and exploratory nature of this study, qualitative methods, supported by quantitative methods, were the dominant methods adopted throughout the data collection stage. Despite the methodological shortcomings of the case study strategy adopted by this research (see chapter 1), the final version of the research methodology proved to be an effective mechanism to conduct the case study.

#### **6.3.1 The Case Study Choice**

Tenth of Ramadan City proved to be a good case for examination. As explained before, TRC has a fairly unique context in which the power and interests interaction

between the political leadership, interest groups, and the constraining socio-political and socio-economic structures could be traced and documented. Due to its relatively recent construction, since 1976, TRC proved to be a 'mild' and 'manageable' case in terms of the complexity of social relationships and power interactions. The exploration and explanation of the relationship between the political economy change, both at the national and local level, the institutional arrangements and power structures, and physical planning practice in the context of TRC, helped greatly in the analysis of the decision-making cycle and the reasons behind the gap between the physical planning formulation and the resulting land use patterns from the implementation process.

### **6.3.2 The Research Methods**

The documentation and archival records proved to be a very valuable source of information. They helped in providing the background upon which the process of data collection was conducted in the field. They were simultaneously consulted to trace the names and official roles of key actors and institutions, physical plans, maps, administrative structure of institutions and agencies, and the different perceptions of the study population about various aspects of the urban development process and physical planning practice at the national and local levels. They also helped in the process of judging the validity and reliability of data collected via the interviews. The direct observation method was also a very helpful tool in supporting the validity and reliability of the data collected through the documentation and archival records. It helped in documenting the existing land use patterns in the industrial areas, as well as updating the database of the industrial establishments records upon which the sample survey was conducted.

The semi-structured interviews also worked well in obtaining data and tracing the history of specific socio-political and socio-economic structures in specific time-space edge. Nevertheless, it proved possible to obtain more than one interpretation of a situation, which enriched the discussions and analysis of the case study by providing various explanations of the very same situations and issues. Discussions were held with a total of 84 informants classified in four main groups: the government (both at the central and local levels), the interest groups, the consultants, and the manufacturing workers.

The research also adopted the sample survey method in obtaining data about the perception of manufacturing workers with respect to the urban development planning

process and physical planning practice in TRC. The main aim of this exercise was to complement the data collected from the semi-structured interviews. The sample survey was conducted in 29 establishments out of a total of 129 (i.e. 20% of the total number of the manufacturing establishments within A1, B1, and C3 industrial areas) and with 116 workers. It proved an effective method when almost all the semi-structured interviewees failed to provide reasons behind the exclusion of the manufacturing workers from the decision-making process. It also proved a helpful method in illustrating different perceptions, yet sometimes conflicting, about certain issues with respect to the urban development process.

### **6.3.3 The Analytical Criteria**

Analysing the physical planning practice in the context of TRC from the institutional arrangements, power structures, and interests of key actors criteria, added significantly to the understanding of the reasons and causes behind the emergence and disappearance of interests and values in certain time and space edge, as well as the constraining and enabling factors controlling the decision-making process of the physical planning formulation and implementation.

### **6.3.4 Limitations**

On the one hand, the research is based on a case study approach and therefore has the attendant limitations associated with generalising the findings. The findings of the research are specific to Egypt, and in some aspects to the TRC context, which are not necessarily applicable countrywide, let alone in the Middle East Region as a whole. Therefore, this research does not offer a blue print but rather guidelines for the analysis of the physical planning formulation and implementation processes. Nevertheless, it calls for formulating and implementing context-aware (to include political economy, socio-political and socio-economic, power and interests and institutional interactions, and physical dimensions) physical planning practice as well as national and regional urban development policies.

On the other hand, given the political nature of the research, the limited financial resources and time available to the researcher, as well as the constraints experienced in the fieldwork with respect to safety and security, proved to be limitations that inevitably coloured the findings. This became clear, for instance, in the nervousness of the interviewees when discussing issues related to the political economy and decision-

making process; and when the sample survey designed to be conducted with residents around the industrial areas had to be cancelled for safety and security reasons as explained in chapter 1.

## **6.4 THE FINDINGS OF THE RESEARCH**

This section is divided into three subsections: the political economy environment in Egypt since 1952, the institutional arrangements and power structure, and the physical planning practice in the context of TRC. Each section provides overall findings as well as stressing the link with the other sub-sections.

### **6.4.1 Political Economy Environment**

Given Rees's (1999), Albrechts's (1991), Beauregard's (1996), Begg's (1988) and others stress on the shift from modernist to post-modernist thinking in the 1980s and its impact on the national and local political economies around the world as well as on planning theory, presented in chapter 2, the research sketches the history of Egypt's political economy since 1952 - since the regime change in the 23<sup>rd</sup> July Revolution - till 2002. Reference to Harvey's (1989a, 1989b), Ashworth's (1989), Solesbury's (1987) and others emphasis on the effect of globalisation and the introduction of the Economic Reform and Structural Adjustment Programme (ERSAP) on regional and local urban planning policies, and the emerging of the "places wars" debate, the "placeless powers and powerless places" phenomenon, and the "intra-urban" and "inter-urban" competitions into the field of planning, the research illustrates the effects of political economy changes on national development policies and more specifically on the national urban development planning policies adopted by the government to confront the on-going human settlements and economic challenges.

Such background provides a valuable base for analysing the impact on the physical planning practice and urban development planning process in the context of the case study when Egypt adopted the Open Door Economic Policy (ODEP), the New Towns Policy (NTP) and the ERSAP to the resolution of the above challenges. It illustrates the connection between changes in the global political economy and the different objectives of the above policies while providing a base for the analysis of the reasons behind the emergence and disappearance of specific interests and values within the Egyptian society in specific time-space edge. Jencks (1985), Hutcheon (1987), Albrechts (1991), and Beauregard (1996) point out, the focus of urban development

planning dramatically shifted from how to minimise the socially negative consequences of urban development through redistributive measures during the 1960s and 1970s, to how to maximise opportunities given to individuals within the changing conditions on the global scale since the 1980s. Thus, the research documents, through various examples, the changes in the attitude of the Egyptian administration towards the economic processes and the private sector's participation in the urban development planning and decision-making processes.

Reference to Giddens' (1995, 1998, 2000) emphasis on the link between the power interaction between the enablement conditions in society, which trigger the creation and empowerment of certain institutions, agencies and individuals in specific time-space edge, and the constraining conditions of existing social structures, which either admit or resist such empowerment, the research succeeded in documenting and analysing the constraining and enabling factors of social structures as well as the powerful interests within the Egyptian society and their impact on the urban development planning process and physical planning practice in the study period. Such analysis provides valuable information on the political, economic, and social contexts within which the national development policies, as well as the national urban development policies, were formulated and introduced to the Egyptian public.

Moreover, as Giddens (1995, 1998, 2000) stresses the link between 'power' and 'resources' and its impact on existing social structures and on the emerging 'third way' approach into the field of political science, the research contributed to an understanding of the nature of the power interaction and conflicts of interests between the actor groups over the control of resources and decision-making process. It also highlights the impact of the allocation of power and resources, the continuously changing institutional arrangements and power structures, and the changing interests and values of the key actors on the urban development planning process and physical planning practice at the national and local levels.

Furthermore, given the various perceptions, arguments, claims and interpretations of scholars and analysts, including Giddens (1995, 1998, 2000), Walsh (1998), Bottomore and Rubel (1965), Carlstein (1981), Layder (1981), Cohen (1968), Bhaskar (1979) and others, regarding the reasons and causes behind the creation of certain social institutions in specific time-space edge, the analysis of the political economy environment illustrates and provides an understanding of the power

interaction between the existing institutions and agencies and the newly created institutions in specific periods. It reveals the reasons behind the emergence of new institutional arrangements and power structures and shows the effect of such new arrangements on the power interaction within the political economy environment at both the national and local levels.

Given the various perceptions and debate among scholars and analysts including Durkheim (1982), Bottomore and Rubel (1965), Walsh (1998), Giddens (1995), Archer (1982), Runciman (1978, 1983) and others, over the notion of agency and its role in changing existing social structures, the analysis of the political economy environment in the context of Egypt also confirms the significant effect of powerful individuals, namely the successive Presidents and powerful Ministers, and the international and national powerful interest groups on the decision-making cycle with respect to national urban development policies. It also identifies a range of problems such as corruption, lack of coordination between the state institutions and agencies at both the national and local levels, the inter-institutional and intra-institutional conflicts, waste of resources, overlapping of responsibilities, political expediency, the powerful interest groups' (within the public and private sectors) impact on the decision-making process, the lack of urban management skills, and the gap between the official urban development planning process and the implemented patterns.

#### **6.4.2 The Institutional Arrangements and Power structures**

Testing the claims, arguments and debate among scholars and analysts including Skeffington (1979), Davidoff (1996), Lindblom (1982), Clavel (1994), Healey *et al* (1982), Krumholz (1994) and others over the notions of 'diversity' and 'public interest' and their impact on the decision-making of physical planning practice and urban development process, the research found empirical evidence of the way in which the institutions and agencies (public and private) were arranged to carry out the formulation and implementation of the national urban development policies, as well as the power structures between and within such institutions and agencies, have a significant effect on the physical planning practice through the fierce struggle for power and authority to control resources. While examining Krumholz's (1994), Krumholz and Foster's (1990) and Marris's (1994) emphasis on the impact of diversity on power structures within the decision-making process and the role of equity planners to address power inequalities and disproportional distribution of resources, the research shows that the different

institutions, agencies, individuals, and interest groups had different agendas to promote their various interests and objectives, which in most cases conflicted with the original objectives and goals of the national urban development policy and local physical plans. This also contributes to an understanding of the lack of coordination, overlapping of responsibilities, and ill feelings between and within such institutions and agencies.

Following the criticism of advocacy planning by Healey *et al* (1982), Clavel (1994), Krumholz (1994), Harvey (1996, 1989a, 1989b), Scott and Roweis (1977), McDougall (1982) and others regarding the recognition of the disproportional distribution of power among interest groups, the research shows that decisions regarding both the formulation and implementation throughout the physical planning process did not necessarily reflect the public interest but were rather affected by the officials' self interests as well as various political influences. It also documents that the power conflicts and interactions between the institutions, agencies, and individuals resulted in continuous and repeated change in the administrative structures of such institutions and agencies during the physical planning formulation and implementation process. Such continuous change was the dominant tool to solve the problems of coordination, overlapping responsibilities, inter-institutional and intra-institutional conflicts and waste of resources as well as increasing or decreasing the influence of specific institutions, agencies, and individuals in specific time edge.

As Levy (2003), Harvey (1989a, 1989b), Ashworth (1989), Solesbury (1987), Albrechts (1991), Brindley *et al* (1996) and others debate the effect of globalisation on the change in relationship between the institutions, agencies and powerful individuals of the state and private sector as well as the stress on market mechanisms to guide the urban development process and physical planning practice represented in the emergence of notions such as "urban productivity", "urban management", "enabling" market to work, "partnership", and "privatisation" in the field of planning theory, the research, moreover, succeeded in exploring, analysing and illustrating the effect of the successive political regimes and economic changes at the national level on the relationship between the public and private sectors. It reveals that since the adoption of the ODEP in 1974 the private sector was granted access to the decision-making cycle in all aspects of the Egyptian economy including manufacturing industry, tourism, and the construction sector. Nevertheless, despite the un-official power given to the private sector since 1974, the research empirically proves that it was not until the adoption of the ERSAP in the early 1990s that the private sector had a major official and institutionalised impact

on the decision-making process of the urban development process and the physical planning practice both at the national and local levels.

Further emphasis on the important role of agency to change existing socio-economic and socio-political structures stressed by the individualism scholars as well as scholars such as Giddens (1995, 1998, and 2000) and Walsh (1998) and others, the research documents and stresses that the empowerment of the private sector's institutions, agencies and individuals over the public sector directed and influenced the course of events across the physical planning formulation and implementation process as well as the original social and environmental objectives of TRC. It also helped in explaining and clarifying, among many other factors, the reasons behind the gap between the successive original physical plans and the implemented land use patterns.

In short, from the analysis of the institutional arrangements and power structures, the research stresses, on the one hand, the power and institutional interactions, which result in the emergence of new institutional arrangements and power structures, controls the decision-making process of the urban development process and physical planning practice, where the answer to who gets what, when and why lies at the heart of such process and practice. On the other hand, the significant impact of the institutional arrangements and their related power structures on the physical planning formulation and implementation process are not restricted to TRC in Egypt. While actors' interests and values change and the allocation of power and resources within the 'triangle of power' shifted, a new set of admissible and constraining rules that govern the power and institutional interaction at the national and local levels emerges, which could be universally applicable to any context within which urban development planning and physical planning practice take place.

#### **6.4.3 Physical Planning Practice**

The research shows that the urban development planning policy, adopted after the introduction of the Open Door Policy in 1974 by President Sadat, namely the Egypt's New Map Policy (ENMP), to contribute to the resolution of the ongoing human settlements and economic challenges, had a significant influence over the physical planning formulation and implementation of the industrial areas in TRC. Given these challenges, economic and urbanisation objectives have loomed much larger than in many other countries. These have included aims to increase national and regional

income, expand industry, diversify and improve employment opportunities, attract long-term foreign and domestic investment and geographically redistribute population.

Despite past national urban development and economic policies adopted prior to 1974, it was not until the launch of the Open Door Policy that Egypt started to adopt a set of 'comprehensive' policies to tackle the national challenges mentioned above. One such policy was the ENMP, which had the redistribution of population and building strong economic bases as its main aims. Seen as part of ENMP and New Towns Programme (NTP) as well as the National Security Policy, TRC had significant and unique political and financial support by the Egyptian administration, and was backed by President Sadat at the time. Since 1974, TRC went through three physical planning formulation processes (i.e. the 1978, 1982, and 1999 physical plans) and three distinctive periods of physical planning implementation processes (i.e. the periods between 1979-1986, 1986-1994, and 1994-2002).

Following the above findings, the research stresses three critical factors that had significant implications on the physical planning practice in the context of the industrial areas in TRC. First, it stresses the great influence of the relationship between the institutions, agencies and individuals in the central and local government. The stress on such relationship provides the reasons and causes behind the inter-institutional and intra-institutional conflicts affecting the decision-making process and distribution of power to control resources. Secondly, it emphasises the changing relationship between the public and private sector with specific reference to the interaction and allocation of power, which had great impact on both the urban development process and physical planning practice decisions. Finally, it highlights the debate of inclusion and exclusion of key actors in the decision-making process with respect to the formulation and implementation processes of the physical plans. It also highlights the diversity of interest and power interaction and provides an answer to who gets what, when, and why in the context of TRC in specific and Egypt at large, which had great implications for the notion of 'public interest'.

The emphasis on the above three factors affecting the physical planning practice provides a critical understanding of the shift of urban planning approaches to land development adopted by the government since 1974. The research reveals that the Egyptian physical planning practice has double standards and suffers from parallel processes. It shows that as the political economy dynamically changed at the national

level, the government found itself trapped in middle way. On the one hand, it could not seriously proceed towards a complete and clear free-market entrepreneurialism approach to land development. On the other hand, it also could not step back by only adopting the rational comprehensive approach in dealing with land development with respect to all interests in society. Step-by-step the rational comprehensive approach was adopted when dealing with issues of land development that would prevent social unrest and political insecurity. On the other hand, the entrepreneurial planning approach was adopted in times when powerful individual investors are actively involved in the urban development planning policy and physical planning practice. Paradoxically, the two processes co-exist in the same time-space edge and are applied by the very same institutions, agencies and individuals. It can be concluded that the current physical planning practice in Egypt is an agency and power-based process, which contributes to an understanding of, and helps explain, the gap between the original physical plans and implemented land use patterns.

#### **6.4.3.1 The central-local government relationship**

Given the emphasis on the highly centralised nature of the Egyptian government by several scholars and analysts including: Mayfield (1996), Stewart (1996,1999), Ayubi (1980, 1989,1991), Zaalouk (1989), Kharoufi (1994) Rivlin (1984, 1985), Cooper (1982) and others, the research documents and illustrates that local government institutions and agencies were not, by any criteria, allowed to participate in the formulation of either the ENMP or NTP, which were considered as critical parts of national security and interest. It also confirms the claim that only a handful of very powerful individuals within the central government decided the course of events Egypt would take for the coming 15 years. Nevertheless, it has to be emphasised that actions and decisions of such powerful individuals were, to some extent, constrained and influenced by the existing socio-political and socio-economic structures and the national and international powerful interests at the time.

The analysis of the physical planning formulation processes reveals that the local government institutions and agencies of the region within which the TRC was located not only were continuously excluded from the formulation and implementation process of the national urban development policies but also were banned from participating in the physical planning formulation and implementation process of TRC in the period of 1974 till 2002. The research reveals that despite such consistency in the

relationship between the central and local government institutions and agencies at the regional level, the relationship between the central government and local authorities within TRC kept changing across time. Such change took place alongside the political economy change at the global and national levels where the empowerment of the private sector was seen as one of the main pillars for achieving high rates of economic growth.

The research shows that the relationship between the central government, local authorities, and private sector agencies and individuals, referred to as the 'triangle of power', was the main factor controlling both the formulation and implementation process of successive physical plans. The allocation of power, authority, and resources within such a triangle kept changing across time. Consequently, the control over the decision-making process was continuously shifting, as well as the goals and objectives of the physical planning practice. Moreover, the research illustrates that such conflict of interests within the 'triangle of power' resulted in overlapping responsibilities, continuous change in the administrative structures of key institutions and agencies, lack of administrative and political coordination, waste of resources, and lack of supervision and monitoring.

The analysis of the physical planning formulation processes confirms Giddens's (1995) underlying theoretical stand that agency and individuals continuously interact with each other and with existing social structures, and in doing so they constitute society. Examining Giddens's (1995) emphasis that the level of change in existing social structures that agency can achieve depends on the power and resources it has. Given the analysis of the Egyptian political economy in chapter 3 and the analysis of the physical planning formulation and implementation process in chapters 4 and 5, it becomes apparent that the problems resulting from the process of interaction between interests at the national and local levels cannot be solved by giving more power, authority, and access to resources to some institutions, agencies, and/or individuals over others; or creating new institutions and agencies to over-rule the responsibilities of others.

The above problems could instead be solved through coordination and clear definitions for the role(s) of each and every institution, agency and individual participating in the urban development process and in physical planning practice. It also requires a clear mechanism by which the administrative and political coordination could be achieved as well as effective supervision and monitoring. Furthermore, it should be

recognised that such a mechanism cannot be effective without awareness, training, research, negotiation and consultation. It has to be stressed that, however, the above conclusion needs to be tested in future research, as this research only managed to document the negative impact of the opposite conditions on the physical planning practice and urban development process in the context of Egypt and more specifically in the industrial areas in TRC.

#### **6.4.3.2 The public-private sector relationship**

The story of the public- private sector relationship in the context of Egypt is not a unique or an exceptional one. It could be easily recognised in many countries all over the world when trying to plug into the globalisation process as stressed by Beauregard (1996), Albrechts (1991), Rees (1999), Harvey (1989a, 1989b), (Healey 1996, 1997) and others. The research has provided a critical understanding of the reasons and causes behind the ongoing change in such relationship with specific reference to the global and national political economy context. It also succeeded in tracing, exploring, and analysing the impact of such change on the emergence of new institutions and agencies across time as well as on the physical planning formulation and implementation processes since 1974.

By exploring and analysing the modern history of Egypt's political economy (i.e. since the 1952 Revolution), it is shown that it was not until 1974 that the private sector was granted a 'controlled unofficial access' to the urban development process and physical planning practice decision-making process. Access via bribes, corruption, political power, and social networks to the decision-making process granted the private sector the initial step towards the unlimited and uncontrolled influence over the physical planning practice at the national and local levels. Theoretically, in the period of 1974 till 1986, the central government and local authorities were in full control over the formulation and implementation of the physical plans of TRC; however, in practice, they shared much of their power and authority with the private sector agencies and individuals in return for political and financial gains.

Such status of unofficial access to the decision-making process of the physical planning practice and the urban development process remained partially hidden from the vast majority of the Egyptian 'public' where the Egyptian administration turned a blind eye on the suspicious activities of the private sector at the national and local levels. In 1986, such status was to be changed with specific reference to the physical

planning practice and urban development planning process at the national and local levels through the introduction of the Board of Trustees (BOT) in the local authorities' administrative structures where both the public and private sectors officially share power and authority over the urban development process and physical planning practice in the context of TRC. Such empowerment of the private sector had devastating effects on the urban development planning processes and physical planning practice where the original social and environmental objectives of the city were completely neglected, and even scrapped.

During the period of 1986 till 1994, the bargaining and negotiating processes between the public and private sectors with specific reference to the physical planning practice in TRC took a new dimension in reaction to the period prior to 1986. Prior to 1986, the private sector's main aim was to search for entry points to gain access to the decision-making process that would grant financial gains. However, during the period of 1986 till 1994, the main interest of the private sector shifted dramatically towards securing the financial gains not only by participating or having access to the decision-making process but also by controlling such process. At the same time the public sector's institutions, agencies, and individuals were trying their best to hold on power and control over the very same process as a matter of survival. Such struggle for power, authority, and control over resources and decision-making process left its obvious marks on the resulting land use patterns in the industrial areas till this very moment.

After 1994, the public-private sector relationship entered its final phase after the appointment of a new Minister of the MOH, Mohamed Soliman, in 1993. The rules that govern the physical planning practice and urban development process were dramatically changed. A new style of urban management was introduced focussing on the private sector to lead the urban development process. Such new style resulted in a dramatic shift in the power balance towards the private sector agencies and powerful individuals. The public institutions and agencies were stripped to the bare bones from any power or authority over the decision-making process of the urban development planning. The outcome was a strong dose of private business driven urban development planning process. Nevertheless, not all the private sector agencies and individuals experienced the same level of power and authority over the decision-making process. The private sector individuals were classified into two main categories upon which their level of influence could be measured and upon which the process of gaining access and

controlling resources, including land for development, could be determined and established.

Such double-standards in the practice of officials as well as the dramatic empowerment of powerful individuals proved to have a devastating impact on the outcome land use patterns of TRC in general and the industrial areas in specific. In short, if urban development, as Attia (1999, p. 332-3) concludes, is “an integrated process of incremental change leading to high physical standards of living and cultural, social and psychological well-being for the majority of local people as well as guaranteeing their effective participation in political decision-making”, what happened in TRC and its industrial areas cannot be described as urban development but rather as a form of development driven by powerful short-term interests.

#### **6.4.3.3 Inclusion and exclusion**

Given Cornwall (2002), Desai (1996), and Goetz and O’Brien (1995) elaborate debate, introduced in chapter 2, over the notion of ‘participation’ in the decision-making process and its impact on planning theory, this research documents and illustrates the reasons and causes behind the exclusion of specific institutions and agencies from having access to the formulation and implementation process decision-making in the context of the case study in specific time edge. Local people and manufacturing workers were unable to exercise their interests over both the regional and local urban development processes as the local government institutions, agencies and individuals were excluded from the decision-making process since 1974 till 2002. Nevertheless, although local authorities as well as the powerful agencies and individuals in the private sector were given access to such process, there was no effective or enforced mechanism to guarantee residents and workers participation as well as the less powerful interest groups in the decision-making process.

In short, the research shows that the absence of local government, local residents and workers, as well as the less powerful private sector agencies and individuals from the decision-making process had been a major factor in the failure of physical planning practice to achieve its original objectives. The research also documents and illustrates how the participation in the decision-making process got manipulated and sacrificed in favour of the powerful institutions, agencies and individuals of the ‘triangle of power’, as Cornwall (2002) and Desai (1996) emphasise that substantive local participation in the physical planning practice as well as the urban development process requires well-

defined and well-established local powers, training, awareness, and democratic system of elections. In fact the inclusion of the less powerful actor groups is crucial, as they are the legitimate legal representatives of local communities.

Finally, the research documents and illustrates, through several examples in the case study analysis, that in the absence of local powers, training, awareness, and democratic system of elections, unrepresentative local government personnel, the existence of corruption, lack of effective supervision and monitoring pave the way for extreme political expediency and a system of inclusion and exclusion based on 'common powerful interests' rather than on 'public interest'.

## **6.5 ISSUES FOR FURTHER RESEARCH**

This research critically examined and analysed a wide range of hotly debated issues as well as widely recognised critical problems within the field of urban development planning and physical planning practice. Further in-depth understanding of specific issues that arose from the findings of this research would require future research. It is important to note that the suggested and recommended issues for future research below are not in any particular order of importance.

1. While this research provides a critical examination of the politics of physical planning practice and urban development process in the context of Egypt in general and TRC in specific in the period 1974-2002, future research is needed to provide a critical comparison between the politics of physical planning practices and urban development planning process in developing and industrialised countries. Such a comparison would provide the fundamental understanding of the areas of similarities and divisions, and would enrich the contextual awareness of urban planners, analysts, researchers, and policy makers when adopting or recommending the adoption of particular urban planning approaches to land development in specific time and space edge.
2. Further research is also needed to build an analytical framework to enable measuring and comparing the degree of influence and importance of, on the one hand, the internal relationships of the urban development process and physical planning practice (e.g. allocation of power, administrative structures, allocation of resources, control over the decision-making process, the inter-institutional and intra-institutional conflicts, central-local government relationship, etc), and

on the other hand, the context (e.g. political economy, socio-political and socio-economic structures, domestic and international powerful interests, public-private relationship, etc) within which the urban planning process and practice takes place on such process and practice.

3. While studying a state sponsored physical planning practice and urban development planning process, this research calls for an empirical comparative research focusing on the areas of similarities and divisions between cases where the state is fully-engaged and less-engaged in the urban development process and physical planning practice. In other words, it calls for critically testing and analysing the impacts of the progressive and conservative role of the state on the urban development planning process and physical planning practice.
4. So far almost all literature tends to support the claim that more community participation results in more 'desirable' and widely accepted outcomes of the physical planning practice. Nevertheless, few studies have tried to illustrate the counter claim by arguing that the more actors participate in decision-making process the more conflicts of interests are likely to exist, which may have a negative impact on the outcome of the urban development planning process and physical planning practice. Empirical comparative research and studies are required to either endorse or reject such a counter claim.
5. This research paves the way for further research on the impact of the hotly debated issue of centralisation/decentralisation on the urban development planning process and physical planning practice. Empirical comparative research is also required for assessing and examining the outcomes of such processes and practices. Such research would provide scholars, academics, as well as practitioners and policy makers with the needed foundation for building an effective urban management framework to formulate and implement future urban policies, programmes, projects, and physical plans.